

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: Planning Committee **Ward:** Micklegate
Date: 26 June 2007 **Parish:** Micklegate Planning Panel

Reference: 07/00539/LBC
Application at: Factory Bishopthorpe Road York YO23 1NA
For: Change of use to B1 offices and external alterations to the former time office building, including extension to existing car park and glazed extension to roof.
By: GHT Developments LLP
Application Type: Full Application
Target Date: 26 June 2007

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.0.1 This is the parallel Listed Building Consent application which accompanies planning application 07/00538/FUL. This application relates to the conversion and alteration of the Former Time Office Building to form office accommodation (Use Class B1) and the erection of a glazed extension (pod) to the roof.

1.02 In terms of impact upon this Listed Building, proposals include:

- Internal alterations to the layout of the building to create open plan office accommodation. Such works would include the stripping out of modern internal partitions and suspended ceilings and making good.

Alterations include:-

- The removal of the existing windows and replacement with appropriate conservation frames (this includes the removal of a number of modern UPVC window frames which have been inserted);
- The formation of a disabled access (including ramp and handrails);
- The alteration of the Portico to form an entrance, including the removal of modern glazed gate keepers tinted glass booth;
- The removal of a number of modern internal partitions on the ground and first floor to create modern open plan office accommodation;
- The removal of the spiral staircase and formation of anew stairwell and associated toilet facilities; and
- The insertion of a lift core.
- The erection of a glazed extension (pod) to the roof of the building.

1.1 SITE AND HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

- 1.1.1 The former Time Office Building lies within the site confines of the Terry's Factory site. The Factory site is situated to the south of the city centre on the periphery of South Bank. The Factory site is partially located within The Racecourse and Terry's Factory Conservation Area (no.10). The former Time Office building is located within this identified Conservation Area.
- 1.1.2 The Terry's Factory site is bounded by Campleshon Road to the north. Bishopthorpe Road lies adjacent the site to the east. An area used for car-parking by the racecourse during race events lies to the south which is encompassed by Green Belt, which extends to Bishopthorpe. The race course itself and Mickelgate Stray are situated to the west.
- 1.1.3 The Factory site is approximately 10 ha (24.9 acres) in area and comprises of a number of redundant buildings, including 6 Grade II listed buildings and more modern warehousing. The listed buildings were erected in and around the 1920's/30's. The former Time Office building is one of these listed buildings and forms an important part of the group value of these listed buildings.
- 1.1.4 The Historic Buildings Assessment (HBA) which accompanies the Listed Building application attributes the original design to Lewis E Wade and the construction date is placed at 1927, making it one of the earlier buildings on site.
- 1.1.5 The actual site boundary of the former Time Office Building is by comparison far less in area than the extent of the whole site. Its total site area is 0.1067 ha. The building is sited adjacent the main entrance of Terry's Factory site adjacent Bishopthorpe Road. The building can be clearly seen from Bishopthorpe Road, being set back approximately 12.00 m from the road. The building is directly adjacent the former Headquarters Building to the north.¹ The former Headquarters building is 2 stories in height and is approximately 24.00 m from the Time office building. To the west side is the former Factory building². This building is 5 stories in height and is approximately 22.00 m from the former Time Office Building. To the south are the gardens. This area is principally the only formal 'green' area within the site. At present there is a 6.00 m strip of tarmaced area, at the rear of the building which was partially used for storage of materials from out of the former Time Office building and possibly for car-parking at some stage. To the east are the boundary walls of the Factory site, a public footpath and then Bishopthorpe Road.

¹ An application been lodged for the conversion of this building to form a hotel (06/02550/LBC). This application has not been determined as negotiations are still ongoing with the applicant. It is considered that the proposals to develop the Headquarters building are more closely interlinked with the overarching outline planning application (06/02560/OUT) which relates to the development of the whole site.

² As footnote 1, an application for Listed Building Consent has been lodged for the conversion of this building also.

1.1.6 The building was purpose built as the main control point, for deliveries etc. in and out of the site. The original carriageway arches which ran through the building were blocked a number of years ago. Consequent alterations to the façade were based on the existing architecture and appear convincing. The portico, which was used to control the main access to the site and booking in of deliveries etc. has been glazed with modern tinted glass. Other alterations to the exterior of the building are considered to be of little significance/ impact.

1.1.7 The building has been significantly altered throughout the years, for reuse into 2 distinctly separate parts. This has resulted in the insertion of modern partition walls and a spiral staircase at ground floor level. The upper floor has also been subdivided with a late 20th Century office partitioning system. Both floors have modern suspended ceilings. A recent investigation of the building's structure has revealed that it is steel framed with concrete casing.

1.2 REASON FOR REFERRAL TO COMMITTEE

1.2.1 This application is reported to Planning Committee due to officer discretion. This application forms part of the wider proposal/s for the development of Terry's Factory site which will be presented to Planning Committee in due course.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Conservation Area Racecourse 0035

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings Grade 2; Terry's Of York Time Office Block Bishopthorpe Road

2.2 Policies:

CYHE2
Development in historic locations

CYHE3
Conservation Areas

CYHE4
Listed Buildings

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL

3.1.1 Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development

3.1.2 The Council's Conservation Officer welcomes the removal of the tinted glass infilling to the portico and remediation works which are more sympathetic to the original façade. The officer also welcomes the use of the building as an office and the applicant's proposal to remove many of the modern subdividing partitions to form open plan accommodation.

3.1.3 The Officer considers that the new staircase and service area, in the west bay has been carefully considered in its design. She considers that it would be well integrated with the existing structure, although she does note that its introduction means the loss of the original cross wall in the west bay. However, she considers that the wall would continue to be marked by the beam above and its existence is recorded in documentary sources. Therefore its removal is acceptable, in this instance. The officer also views the removal of the spiral staircase and its enclosure as acceptable. She considers that these elements are modern additions within the fabric of the building. Finally, the officer notes that the east bay staircase enclosure would not be significantly altered.

3.1.4 A revised scheme was submitted on 29/05/2007, responding to concerns raised by the Council. The Council's Conservation Officer considers that this amended scheme has addressed a number of points regarding impact upon the listed building. However she still raises concerns regarding the submitted site plan as it does not indicate a number of the revisions. As a consequence, she advises that the site plan should be amended to incorporate the following changes:-

- The entrance ramp should be indicated on the plan. The site plan must be an accurate reflection of what is proposed for the site;
- Secure cycle parking should be relocated to the rear of the building and should be covered. If the cycle storage were covered in its present position it would unacceptably harm the setting of the main elevation of this listed building;
- Extension to the hard surfacing on the south side of the building (car-parking area) should be amended to allow for easier access into the building and so as to create an arrangement which would suit movements around the listed building and its setting.
- Individual buildings cannot be treated as independent satellites on this site. Parking must accord with the strategy for the whole site and to avoid jeopardizing future provision for the site;
- The extent of tree removals shown on drawing AL_L1(0)14 cannot be supported at this stage. Further details should be submitted regarding landscaping;
- Areas shown outside this individual scheme should reflect the existing situation (i.e. without the children's play area, additional parking, new

buildings) as this is introducing details which have not been agreed in advance of an approved masterplan.

3.1.5 Finally the conservation officer identifies the glazed extension (pod) would have a significant detrimental impact upon the architectural and historic interest of the building and we should therefore be refused.

3.2 EXTERNAL

3.2.1 Bishopthorpe Parish Council made the following comments:-

- The former Time Office Building is listed and the Parish Council presume this is mainly due to the style. They state that any changes should reflect this style;
- The Parish Council support changes to the windows and doors as they consider these elements to be compatible;
- They consider the 'pod' would look alien to the existing style;
- As a consequence they consider that the application fails to satisfy policies HE2, HE3 and HE4 of the Local Plan.

3.2.2 Mickelgate Planning Panel commented that they did not support the 'pod' extension to the Time Office Building.

3.2.3 Neighbours: 2 site notices were displayed on 2 separate occasions, at the entrance to the main entrance to the site, to advertise the Listed Building Consent applications and the full planning applications. No comments have been received from any other interested party or neighbours.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 KEY ISSUE

- Effect on character and appearance of the (listed) building.

4.2 PLANNING POLICY

4.2.1 PPS1: Planning for Sustainable Development aims to protect the quality of the natural and historic environment. 'The Planning System: General Principles', the companion document to PPS1, advises of the importance of amenity as an issue.

4.2.2 PPG 15: Planning and the Historic Environment. Central Government advice in relation to listed building control contained within this document states in paragraph 3.3 that whilst the listing of a building should not be seen as a bar to all future change, the starting point for the exercise of listed building control is the statutory requirement on local planning authorities to "have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses" (Section 16 of the "Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990"). This reflects the great importance to

society of protecting listed buildings from unnecessary demolition and from unsuitable and insensitive alteration and should be the prime consideration for authorities in determining an application for consent.

- 4.2.3 PPG15 recognises that generally the best way of securing the upkeep of historic buildings and areas is to keep them in active use (para 3.8), and that many listed buildings can sustain some degree of sensitive alteration or extension to accommodate new or continuing uses (para 3.13). Paragraph 3.15 states that achieving a proper balance between the special interest of a listed building and proposals for alterations and extensions is demanding and should always be based on specialist expertise, and often demands a flexible and imaginative approach by all the parties involved.
- 4.2.4 The importance of listed buildings is reflected in Policy E4 of the Approved North Yorkshire Structure Plan, which states that buildings and areas of special townscape, architectural or historic interest (e.g. listed buildings) will be afforded the strictest protection. Policy HE4 of the City of York Draft Local Plan relates specifically to listed buildings and states that consent for development in the immediate vicinity of listed buildings, demolition, internal and external alteration, and changes of use will only be granted where there is no adverse effect on the character, appearance or setting of the building.
- 4.2.5 POLICY E4 OF THE APPROVED NORTH YORKSHIRE STRUCTURE PLAN (the statutory development plan for the area) states that buildings and areas of special townscape, architectural or historic interest (e.g. conservation areas, listed buildings) will be afforded the strictest protection.
- 4.2.6 DRAFT LOCAL PLAN POLICY HE2 of the City of York Deposit Draft Local Plan (Fourth Set of Changes), approved for development control purposes on 13 April 2005 states that within or adjoining conservation areas, and in locations which affect the setting of listed buildings, development proposals must respect adjacent buildings, open spaces, landmarks and settings and have regard to local scale, proportion, detail and materials.
- 4.2.7 DRAFT LOCAL PLAN POLICY HE3 seeks to protect the character and appearance of Conservation Areas. The policy states that proposals for development in conservation areas should reflect street proportions, which are given to floor heights, door and window sizes and disposition. Supporting text of the policy further states that the elevational treatment of all sides of any development and roofscape are important, not simply the street frontage.
- 4.2.8 DRAFT LOCAL PLAN POLICY HE4 states that consent will only be granted for development to a listed buildings where there is no adverse effect on the character and setting of the building. Supporting text of this policy further states that, it is important that extensions preserve and

enhance the special architectural or historic character of conservation areas and complement the character of listed buildings. Alterations will be expected to be of an appropriate design, using traditional natural materials. The proposal should also be in scale with the original building and respect its character.

4.2.9 TERRY'S DEVELOPMENT BRIEF

4.2.10 The Development Brief identifies that it is important to respect and reflect the historic importance of Terry's Factory site. Also buildings should be legible, i.e. the purpose of the building should be easily understood.

4.2.11 The Brief was subject to public consultation and has been approved by Members. The Brief is being used as guidance in negotiating with developers and progressing planning and listed building / conservation area consent applications on the site.

4.2.12 THE RACECOURSE AND TERRY'S FACTORY CONSERVATION AREA CHARACTER APPRAISAL

4.2.13 Part of the Terry's site is located within the Racecourse and Terry's Factory Conservation Area. A character appraisal has been produced in order to properly consider the character of the conservation area and development proposals which may affect it.

4.3 EFFECT ON CHARACTER AND APPEARANCE OF THE EXISTING (LISTED) BUILDING.

4.3.1 The principle of changing the use of the building to general office accommodation (B1) has been considered in the parallel planning application (07/00538/FUL). The parallel planning application also addressed the issue of cycle storage and the parking provision at the rear of the former Time Office Building.

4.3.2 This report seeks to examine the impact of the proposals upon the listed building. Policy HE4 of the draft local plan states that development should not have an adverse effect upon the character, appearance or setting listed buildings. Policies HE2 and HE3 further support this policy.

4.3.3 The present scheme is considered unacceptable. In particular, the proposed glazed extension on the roof of the building is considered inappropriate. Such a feature would create an incongruous feature and would adversely affect the special historic and architectural interest of the building or the character and appearance of conservation area.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 It is considered that whilst the proposals continue the legacy of employment uses on this site. However, the aforementioned glazed

extension is considered an unjustified intrusion upon the fabric of the listed building. As a consequence this scheme would adversely affect the special historic and architectural interest of the building or the character and appearance of Conservation Area no.10.

- 5.1.1 The proposed conversion and the former Time Office Building to general B1 office accommodation with the inclusion of a glazed extension on the roof, is considered unacceptable and fails to satisfy policies HE2, and HE3 and National Planning Guidance PPS1.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

1. In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposed scheme would cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the former Time Office Building which is a listed building and the Racecourse and Terry's Conservation Area. As such this proposal fails to satisfy policies HE2, HE3 and HE4 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft, also PPS1 and PPG15.

Contact details:

Author: Richard Beal Development Control Officer
Tel No: 01904 551610