

COMMITTEE REPORT

Date: 18 November 2010 **Ward:** Guildhall
Team: Major and Commercial **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel
Team

Reference: 10/01939/LBC
Application at: Thorntons Plc 15 Parliament Street York YO1 8SG
For: Replacement shopfront, fascia sign, and hanging sign
By: Miss Julie Bell - Barker
Application Type: Listed Building Consent
Target Date: 22 November 2010
Recommendation: Approve

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The application is for a replacement shopfront. The proposed timber shopfront would have central recessed doors to replace the existing returns and accommodate a ramp for wheelchair users. Revised plans have been submitted indicating a timber shopfront rather than the originally proposed aluminium shopfront. Mullions have also been added. The colour proposed for the shopfront is cream this has been altered from the original proposed brown.

1.2 The proposed fascia would retain the existing timber background. The background would be cream in colour and the proposed lettering would be brown. The individual cut letters would be 0.005 metres in depth and would protrude from the fascia by 0.075 metres. The lettering would range from 0.4 metres in height to 0.2 metres in height, the extent of the lettering would be 1.42 metres in length.

1.3 The proposed hanging sign would use the existing bracket and be sited in the position of the existing hanging sign. The timber hanging sign would be cream in colour with brown lettering. The sign would be 0.65 metres in height and width, 0.02 metres in width and would be 4.2 metres from ground level.

1.4 The property is a Grade II Listed Building dating from 1836 - 39 with twentieth century alterations and shopfront, situated in the Central Historic Core Conservation Area. The property lies within the immediate setting of a Grade II Listed Buildings at 14 and 16 Parliament Street.

1.5 The application comes before committee at the request of Cllr Brain Watson as the building is listed and there are two other pending applications on the site, one for an advert and the other for planning permission for the replacement shopfront (10/01927/FUL and 10/01928/ADV).

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core CONF

City Boundary GMS Constraints: York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams GMS Constraints: Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; 16 Parliament Street York YO1 2SG 0561

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; The Disney Store 14 Parliament Street York YO1 8S 0559

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; 15 Parliament Street York 0560

2.2 Policies:

CYHE4
Listed Buildings

CYHE6
Shopfronts in historic locations

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

INTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

DESIGN, CONSERVATION AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT - No objections to revised plans (Drawing Number 556-07 Revision C received 28 October 2010)

EXTERNAL CONSULTATIONS/REPRESENTATIONS

GUILDHALL PLANNING PANEL - No objections

4.0 APPRAISAL

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

Listed building applications:

07/00118/LBC - Display of 1 no. non-illuminated fascia sign, 1 no. projecting hanging sign and 2 no. window graphics (resubmission) - Approved

06/02153/LBC - Display of Non-illuminated fascia sign and hanging sign - Refused
- The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed advertisements would result in a significant loss of character of the Listed Building due to the replacement of the existing timber advertisements with aluminium, and a proposed plainer, borderless hanging sign. In addition, the applicant has failed to provide sufficient information that would allow an assessment of the relationship of the proposed fascia sign with the existing shopfront of the Listed Building. For these reasons, it is

considered that the advertisements would be harmful to the amenity and special character of this Listed Building

06/00182/LBC - Display of replacement non-illuminated fascia sign and projecting hanging sign - Refused

- It is considered that the proposed advertisements would result in a significant loss of character of the Listed Building due to the replacement of the existing timber advertisements with aluminium, and a proposed plainer, borderless hanging sign. In addition, the applicant has failed to provide sufficient information that would allow an assessment of the relationship of the proposed fascia sign with the existing shopfront of the Listed Building. For these reasons, it is considered that the advertisements would be harmful to the amenity and special character of this Listed Building

KEY ISSUES

1. Impact on the listed building

ASSESSMENT

PLANNING POLICY

4.1 Planning Policy Statement 5 – “Planning and the Historic Environment” In considering the impact of a proposal on any heritage asset, local planning authorities should take into account the particular nature of the significance of the heritage asset and the value that it holds for this and future generations. Local planning authorities should take into account the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to the character and local distinctiveness of the historic environment. The consideration of design should include scale, height, massing, alignment, materials and use. Significance can be harmed or lost through alteration or destruction of the heritage asset or development within its setting.

4.2 Policy HE4 'Listed Buildings' is also relevant in that it states that consent will only be granted for development where there is no adverse effect on the character, appearance or setting of the building.

4.3 Policy HE6 states that planning permission for new or alterations to the existing shopfronts in conservation areas or on listed buildings will only be allowed if the proposed design preserves or enhances the character of the area or the building.

IMPACT ON LISTED BUILDING

4.4 The existing twentieth century timber shopfront is framed by timber pilasters and a timber fascia that will be retained as part of the proposals. The proposed shopfront would be replaced with a timber and glazed frontage with central recessed double doors to replace the existing splayed returns and accommodate a ramp for wheelchair users. The proposed shallow timber stallriser is of a similar height to the existing plinths to the pilasters.

4.5 The existing frontage is rather atypical in Parliament Street and not considered to fit with the Georgian character and proportions of the building. The proposed

frontage with the box recessed doors, in addition to the visual division of the windows created by the timber mullions, whilst similar to the existing is considered to be a slight visual improvement on the existing, by removing the splayed entrance and creating a more substantial frontage. The proposed timber mullions have been added and provide some division and solidity to the shopfront. Originally an aluminium shopfront was proposed however this has been revised and the cream painted timber frontage has been shown and this is considered to be more in keeping with the age, appearance, and character of the building.

4.6 The colour of the fascia and hanging sign have been revised and is now shown as cream which is considered to be more in keeping with the age, style and architectural character of the building. The proposed brown lettering on the fascia is located directly above the existing and proposed entrance door and appears to be of an acceptable scale with the existing timber fascia, and the existing and proposed shopfront. The maximum projection of the proposed lettering would be 0.0075 metres from the fascia and as such is not considered to be unduly prominent. The lettering against the timber fascia is considered to be of a design and scale that respects the character and appearance of the streetscene and conservation area.

4.7 The proposed non-illuminated timber projecting sign finished in cream with brown lettering would be fixed to the existing metal bracket finished in a brown colour. The design of the proposed hanging sign is simple and is unlikely to harm the significance or special interest of the listed building and would not be unduly prominent within the streetscene.

4.8 The proposed shopfront is not substantially different from the existing and as such the proposed shopfront and the proposed fascia and hanging sign are not considered to impact further on the character and special interests of the listed building than the existing.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 The proposed fascia and hanging sign are considered to be of a sympathetic scale and appearance to the shopfront, and listed building. The proposed signage is not considered to be unduly prominent within the streetscene or the conservation area. The proposed shopfront is considered to be visual improvement on the existing and as such is considered to be in keeping with the visual amenity and special interests of the listed building. Approval subject to the following conditions is recommended.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans:-

Drawing Number 556-07 Revision C received 28 October 2010;

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

2 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC)

3 Prior to the commencement of the development large scale details at a scale of 1:2 showing a horizontal section through the door frames and mullions showing the relationship to the glazing; along with a vertical section through the doors at a scale of 1:10, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in complete accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building.

4 Notwithstanding the submitted plans, the proposed shopfront will have a matt paint finish.

Reason: So as to achieve a visually cohesive appearance and be in keeping with the integrity of the listed building.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the special interests, character, and appearance of the listed building. As such the proposal complies with Policies HE4 and HE6 of the City of York Council Development Control Local Plan.

Contact details:

Author: Victoria Bell Development Management Officer

Tel No: 01904 551347