

Report of the Assistant Director of Transport, Highways and Environment

## **York Outer Ring Road Improvements – Proposed A1237 Clifton Moor Junction Upgrade – Report On Public Engagement**

### **Summary**

1. This report is about the design and public engagement process of the proposed upgrade of the A1237 / Clifton Moor junction (the “Clifton Moor junction”). The report is seeking the Executive Member for Transport’s approval to proceed with the detailed design and, at the appropriate time, the construction stage of the scheme.
2. Preliminary design and public engagement processes have recently been completed and it is now time to conclude the detailed design. This report sets out what has been achieved over the last few months and asks approval to progress to the delivery stage.
3. A decision is awaited from Homes England about the funding bid for this proposal which is being sought through the Housing Infrastructure Fund. It is possible that funding may not be available, and in the event that there is a funding gap, a further report will be taken to the Executive in respect of Funding and the basis for a decision to proceed to Construction.

### **Recommendations**

4. The Executive Member is asked to:
  - 1) Note that the results of the public engagement process have been considered and incorporated in the design where possible.

Reason: To enable the detailed final design of the Clifton Moor junction upgrade to proceed and be completed.

- 2) Note the general arrangement design for the proposed junction upgrade and give approval for preparations and implementation of construction (See Annex 1).

Reason: To enable arrangements to be made to commence construction of the Clifton Moor junction upgrade subject to funding being confirmed.

- 3) Note the ongoing negotiation for acquisition of land and drafting of a Compulsory Purchase Order (CPO) by the Assistant Director Transport Highways & Environment.

Reason: To enable the acquisition of land in a timely manner in order to adhere to the York Outer Ring Road (YORR) programme.

## **Background**

5. In July 2017 City of York Council Executive approved a report setting out the proposed approach and management of the YORR Improvement Project. Specifically, the report gave delegation of operational and detailed decision making for the design and delivery of the scheme to the Executive Member for Transport.
6. Progress has been made with the completion of Phase 1 - the A1237/Wetherby Road junction in 2018. Design and development work has also been completed on Phase 2, the A1237/Monks Cross junction, where commencement of the siteworks is awaiting completion of the acquisition of land. Phase 3, Clifton Moor junction is the next targeted junction in this programme. The decisions to be made by the Executive Member which are relevant to this stage are:
  - a. Note that the results of the public engagement process have been considered and incorporated in the design where possible.
  - b. Note the general arrangement design for the proposed junction upgrade and give approval for preparations and implementation of construction subject to funding being confirmed.

- c. Note the ongoing negotiation for acquisition of land and drafting of a CPO by the Assistant Director Transport Highways & Environment.
7. Running in parallel to the endorsement by City of York Council Executive, the scheme is being funded through the West Yorkshire Plus Transport Fund. The fund is administered by the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) and is governed through a project assurance process, see Annex 2. A Final Business Case (FBC) for the overall improvement programme was submitted in late 2017. This was accepted by WYCA with a condition that a FBC for each individual phase of the programme must be submitted separately to secure funding for the delivery stage.
8. The estimated base cost of the proposed upgrade at Clifton Moor presented at that time (2017) was £2,085,644 including the quantified risk allowance. Since that time a revised scheme has been developed which incorporates a fourth arm and pedestrian/cycle subway, accessing land to the north for potential housing development included in the Draft Local Plan. This larger scheme has been the subject of a bid for a grant from the Housing Infrastructure Fund (HIF) and seeks a contribution of £5m to the cost of the four arm roundabout and subway. Therefore the total estimated cost is £7.08m.
9. The project team have been making preparations to submit a FBC to WYCA during August 2019 in order to secure the base funding for upgrading the Clifton Moor junction.

## **Consultation**

10. A public engagement process has been held which commenced on Friday 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2019 and which ran to Friday 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2019. The plan used for the consultation process is shown in Annex 3.
11. On the 19<sup>th</sup> February 2019 e-mails informing of the proposed public engagement were sent to:
  - Julian Sturdy MP and Rachael Maskell MP
  - Councillors Orrell, Runciman, Cullwick, Richardson, Gates, Gillies, Lisle, Rawlings, Dew, Steward and Aspden
  - The Parish Councils of Skelton, Wigginton, New Earswick, Rawcliffe and Clifton Without

12. The public engagement events undertaken were as follows :
- 5 public engagement events were held at Tesco's Clifton Moor, these were on :
    - Friday 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2019 from 3pm – 7pm,
    - Saturday 2<sup>nd</sup> March from 10am – 4pm
    - Friday 8<sup>th</sup> March from 3pm – 7pm
    - Sunday 17<sup>th</sup> March from 10am – 4pm
    - Friday 22<sup>nd</sup> March from 3pm – 7pmwith officers from City of York Council and partner design consultants, Pell Frischmann in attendance. Over the five events the display was well attended and the number of people interested in the proposals varied in the region of between 200-300 visitors for each event.
  - An unmanned display was set up within the reception area of West Offices from the 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2019 for the duration of the consultation period.
  - The York Outer Ring Road designated e-mail address ([yorr@york.gov.uk](mailto:yorr@york.gov.uk)) received 11 comments.
  - The consultation was posted on CYC's Facebook page and 39 comments were received of which 13 were social and / or unconstructive.
  - Twitter feeds were also posted during the public engagement 5 comments were received as a result of this form of public engagement.
  - A press release was published on the 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2019 as shown in Annex 4.
13. Leaflets and questionnaires as part of a consultation package (as shown in Annex 5) were delivered to the residential properties and businesses adjacent to the A1237 in the Clifton Moor and Wigginton Road locations. This information was also available for members of the public to pick up at the unmanned display in West Offices, mentioned above.
14. The public engagement information mentioned above was also available online via the designated YORR e-mail address: [www.york.gov.uk/yorr](http://www.york.gov.uk/yorr)

## Responses

15. 179 respondents made comments, comprising of 94 electronic questionnaires via the website, 30 were received at the consultation events or via the post, 11 e-mails, 39 Facebook posts and 5 Twitter comments.
16. No direct responses were received from the MPs or Councillors.
17. 39 respondents replied through Facebook. However, 13 of these were social and/or unconstructive comments so the total number of respondents pertinent to this report reduces to 26 providing 30 comments.
18. The Tesco Clifton Moor public engagement events were well attended and this is reflected by the number of comments received. A summary of all the comments are detailed in Pell Frischmann's Report on Public Engagement, which is available in the paragraphs below and in Annex 6.

## Summary of comments

19. 215 comments were received from 179 respondents.
20. Most comments highlighted potential issues with the proposed improvements at Clifton Moor (e.g merging lanes not long enough, concerns over road markings and signing, works being undertaken during busy periods, etc). Although concerns were highlighted, it is assumed that from the nature of the concern that these can be addressed and therefore are classed as supporting comments with reservations. Similarly, where positive feedback in principle was received on the proposals then these comments were taken as agreement with of upgrading the junction. On this basis, 178 comments (82.8%) were in favour of carrying out some form of improvement to Clifton Moor roundabout. Only 14 comments (6.5%) were against and the remaining 23 comments (10.7%) were neutral.
21. The greatest concern of respondents is the issue of merging lanes, with 21 comments suggesting the merging lanes cause problems or are not long enough. The next significant issue of concern received related to 14 comments suggesting upgrading the B&Q junction on Clifton Moor Gate, followed by 13 preferring dualling the A1237

YORR. 12 comments raised equal concerns relating to roundabout road markings, the Haxby roundabout being the source of the traffic queues, and appropriate provision to be provided for pedestrians and cyclists. 11 respondents requested that works should be undertaken to avoid busy periods.

22. Comments were received enforcing the ideal that pedestrians and cyclists are at the top of City of York Council's road hierarchy so greater consideration should be given to pedestrians and cyclists in the proposed improvements. 22 comments were received regarding pedestrian and cyclist provisions in the proposed improvements, with three comments suggesting consideration should be given to cyclists during the works and one comment suggesting the proposed underpass should be an overbridge. Two comments suggested the council should stop wasting money on cycle paths that no one uses.
23. Other concerns aired included driver habits, road markings, slip roads, road noise, environmental concerns and a request that the safety of hedgehogs is considered.

## **Conclusion**

24. In conclusion, most respondents (83%) are generally in favour of the proposals at Clifton Moor. A lot of the concerns they raise are either outside the scope of the scheme or relate to greater traffic congestion at the Haxby roundabout. There is a possibility that should traffic flows be improved at Clifton Moor, then congestion at the smaller roundabouts at the Haxby, Strensall and Wiggington junctions may increase. This issue is not thought to be a major concern, as it only a temporary state, but efforts will continue to consider the programming and phasing of the remaining roundabouts.
25. The greatest concern of respondents is the issue of merging lanes. Longer merge lanes would generally be welcomed to allow a greater throughput of vehicles, but drivers appear to be unsure on how to use them properly. There are misconceptions with drivers in both lanes about who has the right of way. An application by CYC to the Secretary of State for Transport in April 2018, asking for approval to allow some bespoke signing at Wetherby Road roundabout has been refused. It will be difficult to specifically educate users of the A1237 YORR through the traditional channels

so this matter will continue to be a difficulty. However, merging lanes will disappear if and when dualling of the A1237 takes place, and in the meantime CYC's Communications team is proposing to liaise with North Yorkshire Police to create a social media video educating drivers on how the merge lanes should be used, in the interests of safety and helping traffic move more freely on the Outer Ring Road.

26. Improvements to the traffic signal junction at the B&Q traffic lights were requested. Whilst this is beyond the scope and funding of the current scheme, it is recognised that motorists will question why this is not addressed. The primary reason for not progressing a change to the signalised junction layout is due to the need to add an additional phase for right turning movements out of Hurricane Way which will cause queuing back onto the mainline (A1237).
27. Another key issue raised by stakeholders was that the scheme proposals need to ensure adequate facilities for both pedestrians and cyclists. Therefore, measures have been incorporated into the Clifton Moor roundabout design to accommodate this within the footprint of the proposed scheme (see Annex 7), including the following:
  - the provision of a north / south pedestrian cycle link and subway under the A1237,
  - creation of a new network utilising the de-commissioned A1237 carriageway,
  - provision of a shared pedestrian/cycle route around the roundabout to enable users to cross at surface level

All of the above will be designed to connect with future development and improvement schemes.

### **City of York Council Officer Recommendations following the public engagement process.**

28. It is recommended that the Clifton Moor roundabout design is approved as shown on the proposed General Arrangement Plan (Annex 1) as currently designed as this is the general consensus from this round of public engagement.
29. The phasing of the remaining roundabouts should consider the valid comments made about the other smaller roundabouts on the ring

road. However in the short term, construction of Clifton Moor is more easily achievable as a consequence of positive land ownership discussions and the majority of the construction work can be achieved off-line, without significant impact on the travelling public. Funding however is a significant risk without the HiF decision and Executive will need to consider the merits of funding and proceeding with a 4 arm roundabout.

30. As highlighted by the public engagement there are misconceptions with drivers in both lanes about who has the right of way on merge lanes and it is therefore recommended that the City of York Council website and any future public engagement material includes guidance on how to use merge lanes. There is also a proposal to use temporary signs to help motorists in the months following opening of the junction upgrade.
31. It is recommended that cycle and pedestrian facilities, which were highlighted as being of high importance in the public engagement, are promoted wherever possible in this and future roundabout improvement schemes.

### **Design of Clifton Moor roundabout**

32. The detailed design for the junction has been completed following technical review and public engagement processes. Any issues raised have been considered and incorporated into the design (Annex 1) where possible as follows:
  - a. Provision of a north / south pedestrian cycle link and subway under the A1237.
  - b. Utilising as much of the de-commissioned A1237 carriageway as possible to create a new cycle / footway network.
  - c. Incorporating a shared pedestrian/cycle route around the roundabout to enable users to cross at surface level. All of these are to link into any future development and improvement schemes.
  - d. The general approach to the future alignment of the A1237 is to locate it further north to allow provision of the subway and avoid the large diameter water main running orbitally around the YORR at this point.
33. The objective of the design is to increase the capacity of the junction to reduce delay at the projected traffic flow levels and more



closely match the capacity of the section of carriageway between the roundabouts. In addition the objective is to improve the facilities for pedestrians and cyclists where it is warranted by the demand.

34. The proposed design for the Clifton Moor roundabout upgrade is based upon previous improvements to junctions at the A19, A59 and B1224 roundabouts i.e. A1237 approaches widened to 3 lanes, A1237 exits widened to 2 lanes, minor arm approaches widened to suit traffic flows, provision of walking and cycling improvements. The upgrades will also be constructed to allow for the potential to dual the carriageways in years to come if funding is secured.
35. The upgraded roundabout is projected to deliver reduced journey times and lower the level of queuing in the area. The overall saving in journey times between the opening year and design year is expected to lie in the range of 20% to above 10% over a 15 year period. Note that these projections are based on the whole route (all roundabouts) being improved.

### **Traffic Modelling**

36. The proposed junction upgrade is modelled and designed in accordance with current Department for Transport standards. Detailed analysis of this modelling is documented in the Final Business Case approved by the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) in February 2018. This modelling considers the growth of traffic and ability of the junction to work until 2036. This is a standard approach.

### **Current Activity**

37. WYCA approved a FBC+ for Phase 2 Monks Cross in November 2018. The approved budget for this phase is £3.5m and work is in progress to purchase the land required by private agreement. This activity is proving difficult and now poses a risk to delivery of the programme. Whilst efforts still continue to negotiate acquisition of the necessary parcels of land and rights by private agreement, a CPO is now being drafted to seek the necessary powers to acquire the land. A separate report will be brought to the City of York Council Executive Meeting in September 2019 proposing that a draft CPO should now be made by the Council and submitted to the Secretary of State for approval.

38. Once the detailed design for the Clifton Moor junction upgrade has been reviewed and checked, the project team will be in a position to invite tenders for the works. As stated in 2, 4 and 6d above, this will be subject to available funding. Preparations can be put in place for the successful tenderer to commence work by January 2019.
39. Negotiation for land acquisition is currently in progress across the whole of the YORR improvement scheme. At the Clifton Moor junction, the landowners have been approached to discuss the transfer of land and negotiations are at an early stage. Land transfer costs will remain confidential until the completion of the whole scheme as negotiations elsewhere are still in progress.
40. An indicative programme for the whole of the YORR Improvement project is included as Annex 8. The current programme indicates that completion of the programme will be October 2022.
41. During this period, although localised disruption during construction is inevitable, the project team will seek to minimise it as far as possible by careful programming of the works.
42. Also, the project team will aim to keep noise, vibration and disruption to nearby properties to a minimum. The need for any road closures will be kept to a minimum and will only be required for short periods of time for specific activities such as when tying in the new surfacing with the existing road. Overnight closures of the A1237 will be implemented for the final surfacing operations. This may take approximately one week to complete. Access for emergency services will be maintained at all times.
43. A communications plan for the YORR programme has been prepared and through the measures outlined in this document, road users and residents around the Clifton Moor roundabout will be kept informed about the progress of the work. This will include signage on the junction approaches and updates relating to site activities. This will take place before work commences and during the construction when regular updates will be given. Information will also be available through the City of York Council's website.

## **Council Plan**

44. The YORR Improvement proposals are embedded in the Council's Plan 2015-19. The implementation of this programme of highway improvements will be an integral part of the key priorities to "provide a prosperous city for all"; to ensure it delivers the services people want and work in partnership with local communities. Improvements to transport infrastructure are key drivers for improved productivity, this in turn leads to economic growth and the increase in wealth.
45. Residents will be consulted about the junction upgrades to ensure that consideration of the potential impact of decisions in relation to health, communities and equalities has been made.
46. Improved journey times will support the following aims from the Plan:  
  
A city where:
  - Local businesses can thrive.
  - Residents have the opportunity to get good quality and well paid jobs.
  - Efficient and affordable transport links enable residents and businesses to access key services and opportunities.
  - Environmental Sustainability underpins everything we do.

## **Implications**

### **Financial Implications**

47. The estimated cost for the Clifton Moor roundabout upgrade scheme is currently £7m. This estimate includes all works, land, fees, project management and utility diversions. Funding is split between a bid for a HIF grant (£5m) and WY+TF (£2m). Release of funds from the WY+TF will be processed through satisfying the Project Assurance process and approval at meetings of WYCA. A decision on the funding grant for the HIF is still awaited from Central Government.
48. If the bid for a HIF grant were to be unsuccessful, the City of York Council will need to consider options to secure funding for the junction upgrade. The main risk to this approach is the timing.

## **Human Resources (HR) Implications**

49. There are no known human resource implications.

## **One Planet Council / Equalities**

50. The One Planet Council Better Decision Making Tool has identified the following areas which can be explored further during the design and development of the whole YORR improvement programme:

- Greater consideration of renewable materials during construction.
- Consideration about the reduction of crime where subways are proposed.
- Enhanced Landscaping.
- Use of Public Art to provide attractive spaces for residents.

## **Legal**

51. The Council is actively pursuing the purchase of land and rights necessary for the YORR scheme (including Clifton Moor roundabout upgrade) by negotiated agreement. Legal Services will provide resources to process the conveyancing and land transfer agreements.

52. Although, as set out in paragraph 37, officers will be seeking approval to submit a draft Compulsory Purchase Order to the Secretary of State for approval/confirmation, this is a matter of last resort. The Council has engaged the services of an external law firm to prepare the documentation for Compulsory Purchase in order that it is ready to make an order if necessary. Legal Services will work closely with the external legal advisors to ensure there is continuity between the negotiated agreement process and any CPO process which may be required.

53. The procurement process to engage a contractor to undertake the civil engineering and associated construction works will be undertaken in accordance with the Public Contracts Regulations 2015. Legal Services will provide resources to support the procurement process and prepare the relevant contractual documentation.

## **Crime and Disorder**

54. The design of the subway has been approached to reduce any crime and disorder implications. The measures include a straight alignment of the subway and approaches to enable long distance views through the structure to inhibit any hiding places. Lighting and CCTV coverage will also be provided.

## **Information Technology (IT)**

55. IT opportunities are currently being considered as follows:
- Implementation of the Smart Travel Evolution Programme (STEP)

## **Property**

56. Property Services are involved in this project acting as land managers for the City Council. New pieces of land will be acquired for the junction upgrades, the title of which will belong to City of York Council. Property Services will also advise and assist the Project Team in supervising the work of the Land Valuers and Legal firm.

## **Other**

57. There are no other known implications.

## **Risk Management**

58. In compliance with the Council's risk management strategy the main risks that have been identified in this report are those which could lead to financial loss, damage to the Council's image and reputation and failure to meet stakeholders' expectations. Measured in terms of impact and likelihood, the land acquisition risk has been assessed at 21. This is classed as Major/Highly Probable and is the most significant live issue on the project. Other risks have been assessed at 14 or below. At this point the risks will be monitored and managed. A risk allowance has been estimated and is included within the current cost plan for the project. The top two risks currently affecting this project are:

- a. Risks associated with land acquisition. As described above, there is a high risk that some landowners may potentially be unwilling to sell land to the City of York Council by private agreement, or in a timely manner. This presents a programme risk potentially prolonging the time to complete the project and increase costs. In order to mitigate this risk, preparation of a CPO in parallel to land negotiation is being progressed as described in paragraph 37 above.
  - b. Risks associated with utility diversions being more complex than anticipated. These could lead to programme delays and have a cost implication. In the case of Clifton Moor junction, early meetings with utility companies are planned to mitigate these risks.
59. However, specifically in respect of the Clifton Moor Junction if the Executive Member approves the recommendations in this report. The greatest risk is finance of the additional £5m for the 4 arm roundabout and associated environmental benefits, cycle subway and future proofing of the scheme. This risk will need to be considered by Executive in a future report due to the budgetary implications.

**Contact Details**

<b>Author:</b>	<b>Chief Officer Responsible for the report</b>
<b>Gary Frost</b>	<b>Neil Ferris</b>
Major Transport Projects Manager Transport Service Tel No. 01904 551084	Corporate Director of Economy and Place
 	<b>Report Approved</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
 	<b>Date</b> 16.08.19
Melanie Farnham Senior Transport Project Manager Transport Service 01904 553673.	

## **Specialist Implications Officer(s)**

Financial Implications

Patrick Looker

Finance Manager

Tel No.551633

Legal Implications

Gerard Allen

Senior Solicitor

Tel No. 552004

Property Implications

Nicholas Collins

Head of Asset & Property Management

Tel No. 553360

Crime and Disorder Implications

Head of Community Safety

Jane Mowat

Tel No. 555742

**Wards Affected:** Rural West York, Rawcliffe & Clifton Without,  
Haxby & Wigginton

**For further information please contact the author of the report**

**Background Papers:**

1.Paper to Executive 13 July 2017

Report of the Corporate Director of Economy and Place

Portfolio of the Executive Member for Transport & Planning

**Title: “Proposed York Outer Ring Road Improvements – Approach  
To Delivery”**

<https://democracy.york.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=733&MId=10188>

2.Pell Frischmann Report July 2019

York Outer Ring Road Clifton Moor

Report on Public Engagement

## **Annexes**

Annex 1 – Proposed General Arrangement for Clifton Moor Junction

Annex 2 – WYCA Project Assurance Process

Annex 3 – Layout prepared for consultation

Annex 4 - Press Release for public engagement process

Annex 5 – Sample consultation package

Annex 6 – Pell Frischmann Report on Public Engagement

Annex 7 – Proposed cycle and pedestrian facilities

Annex 8 – Indicative YORR Improvement Programme

## **List of Abbreviations Used in this Report**

CPO – Compulsory Purchase Order

WYCA – West Yorkshire Combined Authority

YORR – York Outer Ring Road

MP – Member of Parliament

CYC – City of York Council

FBC – Final Business Case

FBC+ - Final Business Case Plus

HIF – Housing Infrastructure Fund

HR – Human Resources

WY+TF – West Yorkshire Plus Transport Fund