

## DECISION SESSION – Environmental Services.

Wednesday 9<sup>th</sup> October 2013

Annex of Additional Comments received from Members and the Public since the agenda was published.

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
5	Street Resurfacing Petition for various roads in Fulford	Cllr Keith Aspden	<p>The recommendation to approve Option 1 would be an extremely disappointing result for the residents in Fulford Park, Cherry Wood Crescent and Eastward Avenue. While the ranking for these schemes “will improve” as a consequence of these petitions, it is clear that more urgent action is needed. Residents believe these roads are in an unacceptable condition and it is disappointing that these local concerns have been ignored.</p> <p>The report confirms that no money was spent on highways maintenance in Fulford last year and the money earmarked for this year will predominantly be spent on the A19. Residents believe Fulford is not getting a fair deal and while money can be found for various schemes in the city-centre resources are not being found to deliver basic services such as road maintenance in Fulford.</p>
6	Winter Maintenance	Liberal Democrat Group	<p><b>Winter Maintenance Review</b></p> <p>The Liberal Democrat Group was very disappointed with the Winter Maintenance consultation, carried out during the summer when many residents are away and Parish Councils and Residents Groups do not meet. We have received complaints from residents that only having an on line consultation disenfranchises a large section of the</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>population.</p> <p>The consultation itself was quite poor with limited choice, leading questions and no space for “any other comments”. It was not an open consultation but started from a position where much of the criteria had already been set. Although we recognise that people will always ask for more salt bins, expecting people to choose which bins to move was never going to get many suggestions. We can all identify locations in our wards that would appear to meet the criteria and would benefit from a bin but could not recommend moving bins from one location that needs a bin to another.</p> <p><b>Salt Bin Provision</b></p> <p>It is difficult to understand how this can be a comprehensive winter maintenance report when salt bin provision by other organisations such as Parish Councils and Residents Associations or even by other parts of CYC, such as Housing and Parking are not included. It would be more informative to have included all the salt bins so that residents could see the complete coverage. I would contest the comment in Para 7. It is not a fair, clear and transparent system when Parish Councils and areas with Residents Associations can provide extra bins and those without are unable to meet the needs of the residents.</p> <p>Para 33 talks about an “adopted criteria” for grit bins. Who and when was this approved? I question if the grit bin criteria has been applied consistently. Cllr Levene was quoted in the paper as saying that bins would be</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>provided where there are schools, elderly person homes and gradients. However, many of the bins being removed seem to us to meet the criteria and include:-</p> <p>On inclines</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Barkston Avenue,</li> <li>• Chapelfields Road/Marston Avenue, Ridgeway,</li> <li>• St Stephen's Mews,</li> <li>• Grove Terrace/Front Street</li> <li>• at the junction of Tadcaster Rd and Pulleyn Drive</li> <li>• at the junction of Grantham Drive and Howe Hill Close.</li> </ul> <p>At schools</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• loss of salt bin Dringhouses School</li> <li>• loss of salt bins at crossing patrol area Askham Lane for Westfield Primary School,</li> <li>• loss of salt bin at Carr School</li> </ul> <p>At Elderly Persons accommodation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• near Abbeyfields House off Royal Chase</li> <li>• Vyner House</li> <li>• Gale Farm Court.</li> </ul> <p>We are also concerned with the loss of salt bins at local shopping areas and community facilities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• loss of all salt bins in Beckfield Lane area,</li> <li>• Acomb Explore library.</li> <li>• Cornlands Road shops</li> <li>• Foxwood Lane shops</li> </ul> <p>Whilst not disagreeing that some agreed criteria is beneficial, we wonder if the criteria has been drawn up to</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>match the number of bins that can be provided.</p> <p>It would be interesting to have a breakdown of the costs of providing snow wardens with their initial equipment as well as the ongoing cost of grit provision. Para 43 talks of them being used to “mitigate the reduction in the number of grit bins provided” but there appears to be no costs associated with this. If one Snow Warden is recruited per street and they are each provided with the equivalent of one grit bin full of salt at £50 you will soon wipe out any savings.</p> <p><b>Gritting routes.</b> We are pleased that you appear to have listened to some of the comments made and propose reinstating some of the Primary Gritting routes. That will still leave a substantial number of areas without a regular gritting regime and the resultant access problems for public transport and to schools in icy weather.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the Middlethorpe estate off Tadcaster Rd will no longer be regularly treated despite there being a bus serving the area.</li> <li>• Potential loss of the number 24 bus in snowy conditions as the roads are not being gritted in Kingsway West, Ascot Way, Windsor Garth loop, Danesfort Avenue, St Stephen's Road.</li> <li>• No gritting little Green Lane to Hob Moor School, ,</li> <li>• Fulford School and Manor School are also taken off the gritting routes.</li> </ul> <p>Even with the adoption of the less draconian Option 3 the</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>Council will still be treating a lower % of the road network than our APSE family group. This option will also see a further reduction in salt bins but there is no indication of where those might be. Para 36 justifies the further reduction in the overall number of bins “because the assessment process takes into account the proximity of the bin location to the PGR network”. This completely ignores the difference between treating roads and providing self help bins. Even if a road is on the PGR network that does not help pedestrians, which is why we see self help salt bins as a priority. If we have prolonged icy and snowy weather many residents remain housebound, even if the road is treated, because the footpath is too treacherous to walk on.</p> <p>Para 39 implies that this is not the end of the cuts and that there is scope to upset residents with further cuts next year.</p> <p>Page 51. Implies no winter gritting reviews have taken place since 1996 which is clearly not true. The Liberal Democrat administration prioritised the provision of a comprehensive winter maintenance programme and reviewed the gritting routes yearly. We clarified the arrangements for the Winter Maintenance Group (para 6) and how and when the Secondary network is treated. The report to the Cabinet Member is far from comprehensive and makes it difficult to understand what the coverage will be in the future. Annex 5 is attached to the agenda as a black and white map which is useless. A map of the current gritting routes would have been beneficial in order that the current and future provision could have been compared.</p> <p>Annex 2 reproduces the consultation document but the</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>maps used as part of the consultation are not attached. This makes it difficult to consider the proposals for moving some of those bins (annex 4) impossible to evaluate. The extra 8 bins which will go if option 3 is chosen should also be identified in order to evaluate the overall effect on residents.</p> <p>The Liberal Democrat Group budget amendment showed ways in which the winter maintenance budget could be maintained and we feel that this reduction is a step too far. We do not think that the criteria for the provision of salt bins have been applied consistently and that the number of bins that you can afford has taken precedence over need. Cuts to the Primary gritting routes will leave some communities isolated and we know from past experience that actually gritting of the secondary routes in severe weather conditions can take longer than anyone would want because our resources (men and machines) are finite.</p> <p>We have objected to the changes in Ward Committee budgets and the strictures on how the money can be spent. This is reflected in the reduction in the number of salt bins as communities no longer have the ability to respond to identified need as they have in the past. We would ask that some consideration is given to some funding being made available in order that Wards can determine where bins are needed.</p> <p>Reading the comments from the consultation the key issues that residents are concerned about are</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. cycle routes</li> <li>2. elderly vulnerable residents</li> <li>3. Schools shops etc</li> </ol>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>Despite that there is no suggestion that resources could be targeted where they are most needed i.e. where the most vulnerable people are. Para 24-26 ignores the majority of responses. Nobody was interested in answering the "where would you move the salt bin too" question so either ignored it or just suggested further sites. The analysis only looks at the small minority of people who suggested a move.</p> <p>The EIA is less than satisfactory as it doesn't consider what the effect will be and doesn't take into account that large groups of residents were excluded from the consultation as it was online only. The snow warden scheme is itself discriminatory as is less likely to work in areas where the population is predominately elderly. We feel strongly that the report should contain:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. List of current salt bins and a simple yes/no as to whether they will continue.</li> <li>2. List of primary gritting routes and a simple yes/no as to whether they will continue.</li> <li>3. List of secondary routes and a simple yes/no as to whether they will continue.</li> </ol>
6	Winter Maintenance	Elizabeth Brown	<p>I live on Stuart Road and am a mother of 4, I also have a friend in a wheel chair who lives further down the road towards Gale Lane.</p> <p>I have to say that the year we had the really bad weather was horrendous my friend relies on me to take her shopping which due to the weather I was unable to take her out! The road was so bad that even the bins could not be emptied as it was too dangerous, as for pushing a wheelchair not a chance, we have lots of mums in the street with buggies and they also were finding it hard.</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>I would like to see the whole street gritted to make it a safer place to live.</p> <p>Many thanks E Brown 50 Stuart rd</p>
6	Winter Maintenance	Mr & Mrs Gibbons	<p>We write as residents of St Stephens Mews (no 2). We wish to write oppose the removal of the salt bin at the top of our street, for the following reasons;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- our street is steep and we become locked in during snowfall, unless we have access to large amounts of salt to clear our road</li> <li>- our neighbours and ourselves work together to ensure our street, the junction to our street, the road along the green and the junction adjacent to the monument are salted during snowfall.</li> <li>- salt is crucial to these 3 areas, for residents access, egress and safety.</li> <li>- the street The Green never has sun on the area and the street becomes a ice rink during snowfall.</li> <li>- the area becomes packed with visitors, their vehicles and their children during snowfall and we need to ensure the roads are gritted to prevent accidents. Children run around this area during snowy periods and an icy road is a recipe for disaster. I have witnessed and experienced children running across the road and paying no attention to vehicles. The road cambers towards the banks of the green on the right hand side, cars park along the left and it is most dangerous to even drive along this road during snowfall, without it being gritted.</li> </ul> <p>We believe that if untreated this road could potentially give rise a serious incident where a vehicle leave the</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>highways and ends up in an uncontrolled manner into the green.</p> <p>We urge you to visit this area and take a walk around the back of the green and st Stephens mews before you remove this salt bin, because in our opinion City of York Council have a duty of care to ensure the safety of its residents and visitors during the Winter months.</p> <p>Kind regards Mr Mark &amp; Mrs Janine Gibbons</p>
6	Winter Maintenance	Emma Barrass	<p>As fellow residents of St Stephens Mews (No. 3) we would like to thank Mr and Mrs Gibbons for writing to you on behalf of us and our neighbours collectively and to confirm that we absolutely agree with all the points that they make below. The provision of a salt bin on St Stephens Mews is critical if we are to ensure safe passage for us and all drivers who use our street as a turning circle.</p> <p>We wrote to York City Council a number of years ago requesting the salt bins after several winters that had made our road both unsafe and indeed unpassable. The issue came to a head when we witnessed a driver who was unable to stop due to the ice, almost crash into our front wall - the curb and sheer luck saved him from an accident and our garden wall from collapse! We live directly at the bottom of St Stephens Mews so this is an issue that very specifically concerns us.</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>I would also like to add that as residents we often have to help drivers who are stuck in their cars and unable to climb the hill by pushing vehicles from behind (an extremely dangerous situation I am sure you will agree but one that is an unfortunate necessity if we are to keep the road free of abandoned vehicles), this is the case even with the provision of the salt bin so I can only imagine the issues that will arise if it is removed!</p> <p>York City Council clearly felt our original pleas were worthy of a salt bin so I trust that our case for retaining it will be received as favourably. Our salt bin and many others in the immediate vicinity are critical if you believe that public safety is a priority for York City Council.</p> <p>Kind regards</p> <p>Mr &amp; Mrs Barrass</p>
6	Winter Maintenance	Jenny Briggs	<p>As a resident of Acomb Green, I would like to register my alarm at the Council's possible decision to remove salt bins from</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Entrance to Gale Farm</li> <li>b) Vyner House Front Street</li> <li>c) St Stephens Mews/ The Green</li> <li>d) The gradient on Ridgeway</li> <li>e) Library Front Street</li> <li>f) Grove Terrace (on the hill)</li> </ul> <p>As a pensioner and having broken my arm as a result of icy paving, I am very conscious as to how important adequate salting is. This is compounded in all places where there is a slight incline. The bins are a valuable</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>resource when the Council is having to make stringent cutbacks in its workforce as they allow the community to have access to salt as a form of self help. For the second year running, my husband has been part of your voluntary snow warden scheme. Although this is of value to our part of the Green, it is of no use to areas where there are no volunteers and where access to salt for people to use, as and when they deem necessary has been taken away from them.</p> <p>I can only feel this is a retrograde step on the part of the council. Unfortunately we live in an age of the 'blame culture' and as this is the case, I am surprised when health and safety is not one of the Council's priorities. It would be interesting to know just how much the Council is saving by removing the salt bins.</p>
6	Winter Maintenance	Steve Galloway (See Annex 2)	<p>With reference to agenda item 6 "winter maintenance" being considered at the above meeting , I have been asked to draw to your attention the attached petition and request that a copy be published in the supplementary papers for the meeting.</p> <p>Signators are seeking the retention of the existing winter maintenance arrangements in the Cornlands Road &amp; St Stephens Road areas.</p> <p>I support the petitioners and am particularly concerned to see the proposals to stop the routine de-icing of the number 24 bus route. This is a subsidised service with an hourly frequency. A similar frequency service in the Hollybank area (13A) appears to have generated a change of heart with officers now recommending that</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>roads in that area continue to be "gritted". I can see no difference between the two areas and feel that both bus routes should continue to receive routine de-icing.</p> <p>I am also concerned about the plan to remove the salt bin from outside the shops on Cornlands Road. This was heavily used during the last periods of extreme cold weather (Jan - Mar 2010 and Nov - Dec 2010). It is a lifeline for the elderly who use the adjacent paths to get to the newsagent and beyond to the umber 4 bus stop.</p> <p>May I also make two other points concerning the accuracy of the report.</p> <p>it is not true to imply that this is the first review of winter maintenance arrangements since local government re-organisation. In fact the winter maintenance manual was reviewed every year between 2002 and 2011. Few route changes were made simply because the roads most in need of gritting (arterial plus bus routes) didn't change.</p> <p>The network of "highways" salt bins was also fairly stable as those paths and roads liable to icing (those that caught little sunlight), those near gradients and those near elderly persons homes changed little.</p> <p>New streets that had been erected on gradients - such as St Stephens Mews - were added, while some inaccessible bins were relocated. (for example, when the Edmund Wilson swimming pool was closed).</p> <p>In 2011 it was anticipated that the location of bins such</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>as the one at the entrance to the - now closed - Lowfields school would be moved to a more central point in the Lowfields estate although this appears not to have happened.</p> <p>The network of additional bins built up by the Westfield ward committee was in direct response to the wishes of local residents who should know best which paths are subject to icing problems. The report suggests that this valuable local knowledge is being jettisoned without full consideration.</p> <p>At the very least, residents should be allowed to vote on whether to retain additional bins using the (now) limited funding available through Ward committees (forums) or estate improvement budgets.</p> <p>Steve Galloway</p>
6	Winter Maintenance	Andrew Waller (See Annex 3)	<p>I would be grateful if the attached petition (175 signatures) could be included in the documentation for the meeting of the Cabinet Member for the Environment.</p> <p>There is significant concern in the Kingsway West area that the removal of the 24 bus route (along Kingsway West, Ascot Way and Windsor Garth leaving the estate via Danesfort Avenue) will cause significant problems, and the suspension of the route in winter which is a lifeline to elderly and disabled residents.</p> <p>The deleting from the gritting route to Hob Moor School</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>along part of Green Lane is also going to cause difficulties to access the school which has a wide catchment for disabled pupils.</p> <p>My comments submitted earlier (see below) in the process have been truncated in the appendices due to what I assume is a cutting and pasting problem. The letter is referred to as being "email 3" in the appendices which I would be grateful if this could be corrected to the submitted text.</p> <p>“There is no excuse for running a consultation exercise during the summer holidays with an internet-only possibility of engaging with the process. Too few residents have been aware of the proposed changes, and there has been no engagement with resident groups. Consulting on the removal of salt bins from school entrances during the summer holidays is particularly badly timed when this is an annual event which could have been anticipated.</p> <p>The removal of salt bins at schools, shops and old people’s homes are difficult to rationalise.</p> <p><b><u>Front Street Area</u></b></p> <p>To remove the salt bin for Grove Terrace which is a very steep path leading to St Stephen’s church and is the main entrance to the four houses on Grove Terrace is irrational. Unless there is a very clear path gritting process then this should not be considered.</p> <p>The removal of all the other salt bins in Front Street has caused residents concerns;</p> <p>Two elderly people’s homes Vyner House and Gale Farm Court are losing salt bins – with the latter retaining only</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>the one at the rear of the complex (off Gale Lane)  The Acomb Explore Library is also losing its salt bin, and thus there are no remaining salt bins for the route from Gale Farm Court to Acomb Shops for those residents.</p> <p><b><u>Bus Route</u></b>  The 24/26 bus route is being taken off the primary gritting route along Kingway West, Ascot Way, and Windsor Garth, and along St Stephen's Road. Does this mean that the bus service is under threat ?</p> <p><b><u>Schools</u></b>  The section of Green Lane leading to Hob Moor School has been taken off the Primary Gritting route – this is not helpful but has the school been informed ?  Equally the salt bin outside Westfield School on Askham Lane is used to keep the school crossing patrol area clear of ice and snow on the busy Askham Lane road. It has been helpful to see that the outcome of the petitions from residents in Parker Avenue, Hotham Avenue, Vesper Drive, and Chancery Court have meant that those salt bins have been uplifted from the 'limbo' of being 'ward committee' funded when there has been no option to allow ward committee funding to be used for this purpose</p> <p><b><u>Shopping areas</u></b>  The loss of the salt bin at Cornlands Road shopping area, and Foxwood Lane shopping area without any explanation of alternative systems for keeping the pavements treated is going to have a significant detrimental impact on the viability of those shops at a time when councils should be implementing the outcomes of the Portas Report rather than restricting access by residents.</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p><b><u>Gritting Routes</u></b>  There will be a significant impact on transport in the area due to the removal of Bellhouse Way and Acomb Wood Drive from the primary gritting route. The removal of part of Bramham Road from the primary gritting route, whilst leaving the steep inclined route on Chapelfields Road (high numbered end with junction off Ridgeway) does lead residents to wonder how the gritting lorry is going to rotate at the junction with Bramham Road and come back down the hill , or is the council going to insist that gritting lorries switch off the gritting for that part of the route that they will have to travel ?  If the primary gritting routes are being examined then there is a very strong case for putting Grange Lane onto the primary gritting route due to the use of the entrance to the nurseries and school.</p> <p><b><u>Loss of salt bins</u></b>  Forrester's Walk is on an incline and so the loss of the salt bin at the junction with Foxwood Lane will be major loss. Residents at the top of Otterwood Lane have previously requested a salt bin due to sheet ice on the road as a result of shading by nearby trees, and the problems this causes in accessing the bus stop on the opposite side of Foxwood Lane.  St Stephen's Mews are on a significant slope, and residents on Ridgeway 10-20 feel strongly that due to the steepness of the road and driveways in their area that the loss of the salt bin will be significant. Barkston Avenue is also on an incline, but is losing a salt bin outside of number 26, and the salt bin at the junction of Chapelfields Road and Marston Avenue is going even though the road is steep enough to merit being retained</p>

AGENDA ITEM	REPORT	RECEIVED FROM	COMMENTS
			<p>on the primary gritting route.</p> <p><b><u>Broken salt bins</u></b></p> <p>Many salt bins have been allowed to deteriorate over the last 18 months so that they no longer have functioning lids. Thus last winter salt bins like the one in Linnet Way were unusable - suggesting that the removal of that one was a forgone conclusion. I append the letter which I sent to the cabinet member in February for which no action has been taken.</p> <p>Yours faithfully  <i>Andrew Waller</i></p>

