

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: West/Centre Area
Date: 18 March 2010

Ward: Guildhall
Parish: Guildhall Planning Panel

Reference: 09/02258/LBC
Application at: Castle Museum The Castle York YO1 9RY
For: External and internal alterations at ground and first floor levels in concourse and debtors prison
By: Mr Michael Woodward
Application Type: Listed Building Consent
Target Date: 10 February 2010
Recommendation: Approve

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 This application seeks listed building consent for internal and external works to the modern glazed link building that forms the concourse of the Castle Museum, now referred to as the Concourse Building. The proposed works relate to the relocation of the existing cafe from the first floor to the ground floor concourse and improvements to visitor circulation within the building. The agent has advised that the overall objective of the works is to provide an enhanced visitor experience and to improve the commercial operation of the museum.

1.2 As originally submitted, works included-

CAFE AND ASSOCIATED WORKS -

- a) the formation of new folding doors in a glazed window to form an additional entrance that would link the proposed cafe to a future external seating area
- b) the formation of a cafe area with the erection of screens and installation of a freestanding cafe pod
- c) the relocation of the existing retail area within the concourse to allow for the accommodation of the cafe area
- d) the removal of the redundant cafe on the first floor and part of kitchen area of the former Debtor's Prison.

WORKS ASSOCIATED WITH IMPROVING INTERNAL CIRCULATION -

- a) Removal of existing male WCs and creation of two openings 'A' and 'B' in the Debtor's Prison.

b) Removal of a modern spiral staircase, ramp, and the relocation of existing stores to allow for re-sited male WCs within Debtor's Prison

1.3 Revised plans have been submitted that delete one of the proposed openings as it would have resulted in a major alteration to the historic fabric of the original external walling of the Debtor's Prison. The proposed change to the fenestration to form an entrance to the new cafe has been redesigned to be less obtrusive. It is now intended that the relocation of ground floor stores to the first floor and the provision of a new passenger lift would be the subject of future applications for listed building consent. The Local Planning Authority has received revised plans to this effect. Further information and details have been submitted by the agent that clarify the details of the cafe pod, lighting and fire alarms, and structural details.

1.4 The Castle Museum: The Debtors' Prison is a Grade I Listed Building situated within the Castle Precinct that dates from 1701-1705, possibly designed by William Wakefield. The former Debtors' Prison is linked by means of the modern single storey concourse building to the Female Prison, also a Grade I Listed Building that dates from 1780-83. The Castle Museum is situated within the Central Historic Core Conservation Area No.1 and the site forms part of a Scheduled Ancient Monument.

1.5 The proposed works have been the subject of pre-application discussions between council officers, the applicant and the agent.

1.6 The application is referred to the West/ Centre Planning Sub-Committee at the request of Councillor Brian Watson given the status and contribution of the building as a major listed building in the city.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core CONF

City Boundary GMS Constraints: York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams GMS Constraints: Central Area 0002

Floodland Multiple (Spatial)

Floodzone 2 GMS Constraints: Flood Zone 2 CONF

Floodzone 3 GMS Constraints: Flood Zone 3

Listed Buildings Multiple (Spatial)

Scheduled Ancient Monuments GMS Constraints: SMR No.13275; York Castle (including Clifford's Tower)

2.2 Policies:

CYGP1
Design

CYHE4
Listed Buildings

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development- No objections subject to conditions

3.2 EXTERNAL CONSULTATIONS/ REPRESENTATIONS

Guildhall Planning Panel- No objections

English Heritage- Broadly supports the application subject to details of archaeological mitigation being submitted and additional details relating especially to the cafe pod, concourse fenestration, the alignment and impact of services and drainage, works to the former cafe, works following removal of the spiral staircase, any new partitions and a full investigation of the barrel vaulted ceiling in the gent's toilet before the proposal for Opening B is finalised. It is advised that Scheduled Monument Consent would be required.

Other Representations- No representations have been received at the time of writing following the advertising of the application by site and press notices.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 Key Issues

- Impact on the special interests of the listed building

POLICY CONTEXT

4.2 Planning Policy Statement 1: Planning for Sustainable Development (PPS1) aims to protect the quality of the natural and historic environment. 'The Planning System: General Principles', the companion document to PPS1, advises of the importance of amenity as an issue.

4.3 Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 " Planning and the Historic Environment " seeks to ensure that the special characteristics of listed buildings are not adversely affected by inappropriate alterations.

4.4 The relevant development plan is the City of York Council Local Plan, which was placed on Deposit in 1998. Reflecting points made, two later sets of pre- inquiry changes (PICs) were published in 1999. The Public Local Inquiry started in 1999 but was suspended by the Inspector for further work to be done on the Green Belt. A Third Set of Changes addressing this further work was placed on deposit in 2003. Subsequently a fourth set of changes have been drafted and approved by Full Council on 12th April 2005 for the purpose of making Development Control Decisions, on the advice of the GOYH.

4.5 POLICY HE4 of the Local Plan relates specifically to listed buildings and states that consent for development in the immediate vicinity of listed buildings, demolition, internal and external alteration, and changes of use will only be granted where there is no adverse effect on the character, appearance or setting of the building.

4.6 POLICY GP1 is a general design policy in the Local Plan that includes the premise that new development should respect its surroundings.

ASSESSMENT

4.7 York Castle Museum was opened in 1938 and occupies the former Debtor's Prison and the Female Prison, both Grade I Listed Buildings. In addition, the ground beneath the listed buildings is a Scheduled Ancient Monument as it is the site of the York Castle. The application site is therefore highly sensitive to change due its evidential, historical and aesthetic values. The site has the potential to yield evidence about past human activity in York. Its historical value derives from the ways in which past people, events and aspects of York life can be connected through the buildings to the present. The site has aesthetic value for its architectural design and setting, and its relationship with adjacent listed buildings that comprise the current Castle complex.

4.8 The works associated with the relocation of the cafe area and the improvement of visitor circulation largely affect the inside of the building, with the main external change being the new glazed opening in the fenestration to the principal elevation of the Concourse building. The proposed works are assessed as outlined in the introduction of the report-

PROPOSED GROUND FLOOR CAFE

4.9 It is intended that a more accessible cafe area would be formed in the existing ground floor retail area where it would be more prominently sited and would benefit from views towards Clifford's Tower and the town centre. A proposed additional entrance in the fenestration of the building would link the cafe area with an associated outdoor seating area. The proposals would introduce-

- a) A full height screen and associated steelwork adjacent to the existing entrance doors
- b) A 1.8m screen and associated steelwork to the cafe area adjacent to the exit doors
- c) A freestanding cafe pod, requiring drainage alterations and power installations.
- d) Formation of entrance in existing window of glazed elevation to Concourse Building

4.10 The proposed screens would define the proposed cafe area within the concourse, separating general circulation from cafe seating, and would act as a wind buffer. These would be acceptable additions that would be appropriately sited in the concourse without detracting from the appearance of the building. No key internal views to historic fabric behind the fenestration would be obstructed by their scale or positioning. One of the main features of the modern concourse building is its visual transparency, and both English Heritage and the local planning authority would seek to ensure that the introduction of a freestanding cafe pod would be appropriately sited, designed, and constructed in sympathetic materials to minimize its impact on the adjoining historic buildings. The agent has submitted additional plans that indicate that the location, scale and impact of the detailed pod on the concourse would be acceptable. Further details of the materials and finishes of the cafe pod would require to be submitted for approval if Members are minded to grant listed building consent. This detail could be effectively conditioned as part of a listed building consent.

4.11 The glazed elevation that forms the principal elevation of the Concourse Building has a dedicated entrance and exit that are treated differently and the introduction of a further style of opening raised concerns from English Heritage and the local planning authority. The original proposal for a bi-folding door would have introduced a further variation in the design of the openings of the building that would further visually fragmented the elevation. Revised plans have been submitted that propose an outer frame similar to the general windows, with the panes being frameless at the hinged sides that would create the appearance of a single window when the doors are shut. It is considered that this revision would achieve greater simplicity and unity, whilst achieving the link between the proposed internal and future external cafe areas. The proposed pattern of glazing is unlikely to detract from the existing appearance and rhythm of the fenestration to the principal elevation of the Grade 1 Listed Building.

IMPROVED VISITOR CIRCULATION/ RELOCATION OF MALE WCs/PROPOSED WALL OPENINGS

4.12 The remaining proposals seek to alter the way visitors flow through the Concourse to the displays in the Debtor's Prison. They aim to improve circulation flow within the Debtor's Prison and its link to the Concourse, raise the prominence of the entry to the Debtors Prison from within the Concourse, have been designed to avoid a pinch-point being formed at the Concourse exit, and would provide a re-entry to the Concourse adjacent to the re-sited retail area following the introduction of the

proposed ground floor cafe. The current entrance to the Debtor's Prison would be retained. The major changes would occur at two distinct areas in the Debtor's Prison: at the existing exit to the concourse/ store room/ spiral staircase area to accommodate the relocated Male WC and at the existing Male WCs area where a new exit is proposed to link the Debtor's Prison to the Concourse following the relocation of the Male WCs.

Existing exit to the concourse/ store room/ spiral staircase area to accommodate the relocated Male WCs

4.13 The existing opening that forms the exit between the Debtor's prison and the Concourse would be closed off with the former opening highlighted as a recessed display area. The new male WCs would require drainage connections. It is intended that an existing modern spiral staircase that links the ground floor with the first floor would be removed to allow for the works that would improve the internal circulation of visitors. The stair is unused and its loss would not harm any special interest of the listed building. The existing internal finishes to the ground and first floor compartments where the modern spiral staircase is situated are modern with no historic value. The specification of the proposed reinstatement works to the affected areas would be acceptable. Existing walls would be re-plastered or dry-lined, depending on the extent of making good required after the removal of partitions and fittings. The ceiling would be provided with a new under-drawn plasterboard ceiling utilising metal firrings.

Removal of Male WCs and formation of new exit to link the Debtor's Prison to the Concourse

4.14 The existing Male WCs would be stripped out and would essentially become the new circulation route from the Debtor's Prison to the Concourse. There is an existing opening between the Concourse and the Debtor's Prison that is currently a doorway, visible from the Concourse but over-boarded to the Male WCs side. The intention to reinstate this opening to its original format as a window in terms of width and stonework would enhance the special quality of the listed building, though the opening would remain open from floor to head (Opening A). This would be an acceptable alteration subject to the details of the stone to be used and the method of dressing being approved. The proposal to introduce a new opening (Opening B) to simplify the route through the display area has now been deleted from the scheme.

ANCILLARY WORKS

4.15 The existing first floor cafe and kitchens would become redundant if listed building consent is granted for the ground floor cafe. It is also noted that the kitchen would be redundant as there would be no cooking of food that would require kitchen fittings and flues. The proposed works to the first floor cafe and kitchen facilities would retain original finishes; flue brackets to plastered walls and ceilings would be removed and made good; the removal of extracts through windows would be removed and new window panes would be installed with beading and decoration to match the existing profile, fixings, and finishes. Subject to the approval of the detail, it is considered that the works would be acceptable. Any further works to the kitchen

and cafe area, particularly to accommodate a relocated store from the ground floor, would be the subject of a future application for listed building consent.

4.15 The relocation of the retail area within the Concourse would have minimal impact on the Listed Building and would be an acceptable alteration.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 The proposed works to the listed building would result in a more accessible and prominent cafe within the ground floor of the Concourse Building, better circulation for visitors, with more commercial viability from the relocated retail area.

5.2 It is concluded that the proposed works would not harmfully detract from the original fabric of the Grade I listed building. There would be no conflict with Policies HE4 and GP1 of the Local Plan, and related national guidance contained in Planning Policy Guidance Note No. 15 " Planning and the Historic Environment" and Planning Policy Statement 1 " Delivering Sustainable Development. "

5.3 If Members are minded to approve the application for Listed Building consent, it is requested that officers are granted delegated authority to approve the application following receipt of comments from English Heritage for the revised and additional details. The consultation period expires on 19 March 2010.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC)

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans and other submitted details:-

Drawing No. LBC1 (10) Rev 10 B Ground Floor Plan as Proposed, Received 4.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC1 (10) 12 Rev A Cafe Area as Proposed, Received 4.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC1 (10) 14 Rev A Ground Floor Plans Demolitions, Received 4.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC (10) 11 Rev A First Floor Plan Existing and Proposed, Received 1.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC1 (31) 10 Rev B Alterations to Fenestrations, Received 1.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC1 (43) 10 Rev A Floor Finishes as Proposed, Received 5.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC1 (45) 10 Ceiling Finishes as Proposed, Received 15.12.2009

Drawing No. LBC1 (42) 10 Rev A Wall Finishes as Proposed, Received 4.3.2010

Drawing No. LBC1 (52) 10 Rev A WC & Circulation area works, Received 4.3.2010

Drawing No. 2970/1/T/003 Ground Floor Proposed Lighting & Fire Alarm Layout
Received 28.1.2010

Drawing No. 2970/1/T/202 Ground Floor Proposed Lighting & Fire Alarm Layout
Received 28.1.2010

Drawing No. 9115/S1 Proposed Structural Details Received 28.1.2010

Cafe Pod Details-

Drawing No. YCM CS Elevations A-C Rev 2 Received 1. 3 2010

Drawing No. YCM CS Equipment Rev 2 Received 1. 3 2010

Drawing No. YCM CS Elevations A & B Rev 2 Received 1. 3 2010

Drawing No. YCM CS Under Worktop 005 Rev 2 Received 1. 3 2010

Drawing No. YCM CS CS Worktop 004 Rev 2 Received 1. 3 2010

Drawing No. YCM CS CS Worktop 002 Rev 2 Received 1. 3 2010

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 Prior to the commencement of the works hereby approved, the following details shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority, and thereafter the works shall be implemented and retained in accordance with the approved details:

- a) External materials and finishes of cafe pod, including signage
- b) Sample of stone, details of the method of dressing the stone, details of the stonemason appointed to implement the works and the composition of the mortar mix should be submitted for approval prior to the commencement of works to 'Opening A' that connects the Museum Concourse to the former Debtor's Prison.
- c) A sample of replacement glazing to the first floor windows, following the removal of modern ductwork
- d) Drainage details of any new services required in association with the café pod and new male WCs.

Reason: To ensure that the details would be acceptable in the interests of the visual amenity and historical and architectural interest of the Listed Building.

4 All disturbed internal surfaces shall be made good to match the architectural and historic period of its surroundings.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenity and historical and architectural interest of the Listed Building.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the visual amenity and character of the listed building. As such, the proposal complies with Policies HE4 and GP1 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan - Incorporating the Proposed 4th Set of Changes (2005) ; and national planning guidance contained in Planning Policy Statement 1 " Delivering Sustainable Development " and Planning Policy Guidance Note No. 15 " Planning and the Historic Environment. "

2. SCHEDULED MONUMENT CONSENT

You are advised that the proposal would involve works that appear to require Scheduled Monument Consent . For further information please consult English Heritage, Tanner Row, York.

Contact details:

Author: Fiona Mackay Development Control Officer (Tues - Fri)
Tel No: 01904 552407