

Executive 31 August 2017

Report of the Corporate Director of Economy & Place Portfolio of the Executive Member for Transport & Planning

## Scarborough Bridge - Footbridge Replacement and Upgrade

## **Summary**

1. This report outlines the proposals to replace and upgrade the existing footbridge spanning the River Ouse adjacent to 'Scarborough (Railway) Bridge'. The new bridge will be substantially wider to enable shared pedestrian and cycle use and feature ramped access from all sides, providing a continuous traffic-free and step-free route from York Station to the northern embankment of the river, in addition to the city centre itself. Network Rail will be further commissioned to lead on the design and full construction of this asset, to be delivered during 2018.

#### Recommendations

- 2. The Executive is asked to:
  - 1) Approve in principle the replacement and upgrade of the Scarborough Bridge footbridge and associated ramps / structures
  - 2) Note the continued progression of the scheme at risk through the planning and procurement stages Grant the Assistant Director for Transport, Highways & Environment delegated powers to make any future required amendments to the scheme as a result of emerging detailed design etc.
  - 3) Approve an allocation for risk within the Local Transport Plan programme 2018/19 in order to ensure that sufficient funds are available to deliver the proposed scheme.

4) Subject to funding agreements being agreed with other contributors and relevant planning consent being granted authorise the Assistant Director for Transport, Highways & Environment to progress the scheme including awarding contracts for the future delivery of the project.

Reason: The recommended replacement of the footbridge offers a unique opportunity to significantly improve one of a limited number of city centre river crossings and significantly improve access to the Railway Station and York Central Development site.

## **Background**

- 3. The original railway bridge over the river Ouse known as Stephenson's Scarborough Railway Bridge was opened in 1845 and remained in use for almost thirty years. This bridge originally had a public footpath between the two tracks reached by stairs inside each abutment. This rail bridge was renewed in 1875 using the original abutments and the central pier, although pedestrian access was moved to the outside of the bridge along the east side on a separate footbridge, and the abutment stairways were subsequently abandoned. This footbridge has remained to the present day.
- 4. The objective of this project is to improve the river crossing to provide:
  - A step free access across the river for pedestrians, cyclists, wheelchair users and people with pushchairs.
  - A wider bridge to increase crossing capacity and reduce the conflict between users.
  - A crossing accessible during high river levels.
  - A reduction of conflict between riverside path and bridge users at ground level.
  - Direct traffic free access between railway station and city centre via museum gardens
  - Reduction of cycle/vehicle conflict on Lendal Bridge
  - Improved sustainable access to the York Central site
- 5. Current usage surveys have shown that on average over 2,600 pedestrians and over 600 cyclists use the footbridge daily. At present cyclists have to lift / wheel their bikes up the steep narrow steps and the footbridge deck itself is only 1.3 metres wide. The footbridge is currently inaccessible for wheelchair users or others with mobility impairments. Additionally this river crossing becomes completely unusable when river

levels are high as the current access is via the steps from the riverside paths.

- 6. An improved crossing at this location will provide a step-free, traffic-free access route via Museum Gardens direct between the Railway Station and the City Centre. A plan of the cycling connectivity which the river crossing provides is illustrated at Annex A. As shown, the crossing will also significantly improve the sustainable access options to the York Central site from the north of the river. In 2015 the Council successfully bid for a bridge upgrade scheme to be included in the West Yorkshire Combined Authority's Cycle City Ambition Grant programme. A match funding allocation of £1m was also included in the 2015/16 Capital Programme to enable the scheme to proceed.
- 7. City of York Council commissioned Network Rail during 2015/16 to carry out a GRIP2 feasibility report to investigate the possibility of providing a new shared-use pedestrian and cycle bridge adjacent to the existing Scarborough railway Bridge, replacing the existing inadequate footbridge. The report gave 3 concept design options for a new bridge:
  - a) A cable-stayed bridge supported from an upgraded central pier. However, this option was discounted due to the excessive impact loading required on the central pier.
  - b) A freestanding design featuring a single mastered suspension bridge with a 24 metre high steel mast set on the north bank of the river. However this option was also discounted due to its excessive cost and visual impact.
  - c) A simpler solution whereby the bridge is based on the simple structural concept of removing the existing footbridge and utilising its support position to accommodate a steel box beam off which the new bridge deck can be cantilevered. This option was considered to be the best balance of aesthetic design, structural simplicity and cost.
- 8. Following identification of a viable solution, as shown at Annex B, a subsequent GRIP3 option selection report was commissioned and undertaken by Network Rail. During this process significant work was undertaken on the proposed bridge design as well as in-depth investigative surveys in order to ascertain ground conditions and reduce risk to the programme.

- 9. The proposed upgraded bridge would provide a much wider bridge deck, increased to a width of 3.7 metres, with improved access. For the first time, the new bridge would be accessible for wheelchair users and those with mobility issues, as well as pedestrians with pushchairs or wheeling suitcases.
- 10. The proposal also includes for improved and wider links between the riverside paths and the new bridge, providing a more direct and convenient link between York Station, the off road cycle network, and the north side of the river. This would comprise 3.0 metre wide ramps / paths connecting to the south with the existing station access ramps from Post Office Lane. This layout is considered to provide the most cost effective solution with the best overall benefit for pedestrians and wheelchair users in the area travelling between the station and bridge whilst also providing a direct connection for cyclists between the riverside and the bridge. To the north a ramp will connect with the riverside and, if affordable, an additional spur will be provided northwards adjacent to Marygate car park. Stepped access from both riversides would also be provided. The ramp layout on the station Please see below section regarding stepped access to the bridge.
- 11. The proposed bridge and its associated access ramps are all to be restricted to a land area fully within the ownership of Network Rail. An existing area of land required for the northern ramp is currently leased to the Abbey Guest House (as a car park) by Network Rail on a short-term rolling contract. Constructive discussions have already been made with the owners of the Guest House.

### Bridge deck width

- 12. An aspiration early in the design process was to provide as wide as possible usable bridge deck in order to accommodate the many anticipated users. Network Rail were asked to look at providing a 4.5 metre wide deck. However, even with the proposed reduction in weight as a result of removing the stone pilasters, the weight of the new bridge was found to exceed the capacity of the foundations when a 4.5 metre bridge deck was used, especially due to the eccentric loading.
- 13. The outline design work has confirmed that the existing bridge foundations only have the capacity to support a bridge deck of up to 3.7 metres in width. For information, the comparable Millennium Bridge (also shared-use) has a usable width of 4.0 metres.

## Stepped access to the bridge

- 14. It is proposed to provide stepped access to the new bridge to allow access to the riverside paths. The objective is to provide steps at locations which minimise conflict between users on the bridge deck and at ground level. Two options have been considered for these steps:
  - a) The preferred option is to construct new steps on the outside of the bridge. This would maintain a consistent bridge deck width and also encourages pedestrian flows to the balustrade side of the bridge which is likely to be favoured by most. Conflict at the riverside path level would also be significantly reduced. However it should be noted that the closure of the existing steps may be considered to be a loss of part of the existing bridge's history and character.
  - b) Retain the existing steps which sit to the back of the bridge and are constructed as part of the abutment. The steps would require some refurbishment. However, these would cause a pinch point of the bridge deck as it passes the steps, down to approximately 2.3 metres (over 9 metres length). In addition the steps in this position would encourage pedestrian flows to the railway side of the new bridge rather than the balustrade overlooking the river which is likely to be favoured by most. Thus some cyclist and pedestrian conflict on the bridge deck is possible. The existing conflict between cyclists on the riverside path on the south side of the river and pedestrians at the bottom of the steps would remain but reduced if the lower part of the steps was turned to be parallel to the river.
- 15. It is proposed to progress the new steps option subject to the resolution of planning and technical issues.

# Cost & Source of funding

16. The cost estimate prepared by Network Rail for the construction of the new bridge is £4.871million, including a £483k risk/contingency allowance. It is proposed to fund the scheme from a number of sources indicated in the following table:

Funding	£k
West Yorkshire Combined Authority: CityConnect programme - tbc	1,935
CYC: Capital Programme - existing	972
York North Yorkshire East Riding Local Enterprise Partnership (YNYER LEP): Local Growth Fund - tbc	1,500
CYC: Local Transport Plan (LTP) 2018/19 - proposed	464
Total	4,871

### Anticipated programme

- 17. Subject to agreement by the Executive, a high level indicative programme is illustrated below:
  - 31 August 2017: Executive Decision to Proceed subject to confirmation of funding
  - October 2017: WYCA and YNYER LEP Funding Decisions
  - November 2017– January 2018: Planning Application
  - March 2018: Award of contract for construction
  - January 2019: Completion

# Future ownership and maintenance

- 18. There have been initial discussions with Network Rail regarding the future ownership of the new bridge and associated structures, including who will be liable for future inspection and maintenance. The existing footbridge is currently owned and maintained by Network Rail.
- 19. The current proposal is for the new bridge to become a council owned asset with the new bridge and associated infrastructure maintenance obligations to be passed to CYC. All Network Rail owned land required for the construction of the new bridge will however remain in Network

Rail's freehold ownership. A commuted sum will be paid to the council by Network Rail for a proportion of future maintenance liabilities.

#### Consultation

- 20. Public consultation was undertaken during July 2017, including a two-day public exhibit at York Station. 142 individual responses from members of the public and interested parties have been received. This included a petition with 16 signatories wishing to show support for the proposals. Specific points raised within the consultation have been collated into common themes and can be seen at Annex C along with an Officers response where applicable.
- 21. From the public consultation it is evident that there is clear support for the proposed new bridge, with 135 (of 142) comments stating their enthusiastic support for the project. Comparably, there were only two objections received.
- 22. The next most popular comments were concerning current difficulties experienced with the existing bridge and endorsing our proposals. Many responses were also received requesting that the option involving new steps on the outside of the bridge be taken forward to avoid the potential pinch point on the bridge deck.
- 23. Comments were also received from a number of stakeholders / organisations and these are summarised below:

York Green Party – Welcome the proposals as they would provide an accessible traffic free river crossing near the city centre, although not fully convinced that the space should be unsegregated. Would prefer to see new steps built on the outside of the bridge to remove the potential pinch points on the bridge deck and by the riverside archway. Would like to see Post Office Lane and Marygate Lane paths widened and well maintained, with access through the flood barrier improved. Would love to see a social space / platform / widening in the centre of the bridge for people to meet / admire and photograph the view etc.

**Micklegate Ward Planning Panel** – Supportive of the proposals and would like to see the option taken forward featuring the new steps on the outside of the bridge. Some concern over shared use.

**Sustrans** – Greatly welcome the proposals. Concern that the proposed width would be insufficient for future increased usage and would advocate a wider bridge deck. Favour new steps on the outside of the

bridge to remove the pinch point conflicts. Adjacent paths leading to the new bridge should be widened to cater for increased usage also.

**Cycling UK** – Supportive of the proposals. Anticipating greater surge in cyclists using this route and the northern station entrance, thus additional cycle parking would be required at this end of the station

**York Older People's Assembly** – Supportive of the proposals and considers them well thought through, catering for all possible users.

**York Health Walks** – Very welcoming of proposals. Requests that new steps be provided on the outside of the new bridge to avoid the potential pinch point conflict points on the bridge and the riverside archway.

**York Greenways** – Supportive and regards this as a really important transport link for the city. The fact that so many use the bridge now just goes to show the demand and the potential for increasing its use. Submitted a 16 signatory petition showing their support.

**Treemendous York** – Supportive of the proposals. Would like demarcation / segregation for users. Main concern is landscaping and any trees to be removed and the mitigation proposed to replace them.

Abbey Guest House – Welcomes the proposals to improve access to the station, although asks for the council to be thoughtful in its approach and mindful of the environmental impact this project will have on the area. Seeks assurances that new facility and landscaping will be well maintained. Bridge and ramps should be designed to deter antisocial behaviour including being well lit and patrolled / CCTV. Little hard landscaping preferred with greater planting / habitat.

Other concerns regarding future provision of car parking spaces are being addressed directly with the owners of the Abbey Guest House.

# **Options**

- 24. There are 2 options available to the Executive:
  - 1) Approve in principle the replacement and upgrade of the Scarborough Bridge footbridge and associated ramps / structures. This option would also continue the progression of the scheme at risk through the planning and procurement stages with the commencement of delivery being subject to funding agreements being agreed with other contributors and relevant planning consent being granted. This is the recommended option.
  - 2) Do not approve the principle of replacing Scarborough Bridge.

### **Analysis**

- 25. It has been a long held aspiration to improve the accessibility of the river crossing at Scarborough Bridge with the only viable solution considered to be to replace the existing narrow footbridge with one which is much wider and more accessible. Following extensive investigatory and design work, a bridge design has now been produced which fulfils the objectives and which is affordable subject to the confirmation of contributions from other bodies.
- 26. Funding has been allocated within the Council's capital programme and provisional funding in principle has already been allocated to this scheme from a number of external sources. The funding from the West Yorkshire Combined Authority City Connect Programme is time dependent with the need for commencement on the delivery stage to be confirmed by March 2018. To ensure that the scheme is progressed to meet this deadline the planning and procurement stages will need to be progressed in advance of all of the funding being confirmed. The additional information available from this planning/procurement work would also be beneficial to secure alternative funding sources if the anticipated funding is not confirmed. To progress this option approval is sought to commence procurement of an appropriate design and build contractor to deliver the project. Approval for additional resources to cover risk using the Local Transport Plan programme 2018/19 is also requested in order to ensure that sufficient funds are available to deliver the proposed scheme.
- 27. Option 2, to do nothing to improve the footbridge, would mean that the opportunity to significantly improve the accessibility of the river crossing and connections into York Central York Station would be lost. Therefore this option is not recommended.

#### **Council Plan**

28. "A Prosperous City For All"; "A Focus on Frontline Services". The proposed Scarborough Bridge upgrade supports the prosperity of the city by improving the effectiveness, safety and reliability of the transport network, which helps economic growth and the attractiveness for visitors and residents. Enhancements to the efficiency of the sustainable transport network in addition to promoting a traffic-free and safe access to and from the station and the York Central development site will

improve the reliability and accessibility to other council services across the city.

### **Implications**

#### **Financial**

29. The feasibility study undertaken by Network Rail indicates that the estimated cost of the proposed scheme is £4.871m including an allowance of approximately 10% for risk. It is proposed to fund the scheme from a variety of sources.

Funding	£k
CityConnect tbc	1,935
CYC Capital Programme - Existing	972
YNYER LEP tbc	1,500
CYC - LTP (2018/19)	464
Total	4,871

- 30. The council allocated £1m (£972k remaining) in the capital programme in 2015/16 to match fund an allocation of £1.953m in the West Yorkshire City Connect programme for the delivery of the scheme by the end of 2017/18. Owing to cost pressures across the £52m West Yorkshire CityConnect programme a review is currently being undertaken with the funding for 4 schemes which were originally planned to be delivered at the end of the programme, including Scarborough Bridge, placed on a reserve list subject to confirmation at the end of October 2017.
- 31. The York North Yorkshire East Riding LEP successfully bid for funding for the York Central Development, including an allocation for an upgrade of Scarborough Bridge, from the Growth Fund. The success of the York Central development is dependent on maximising the number of trips into the site by sustainable means. The Scarborough Bridge Scheme will provide a high quality traffic free connection between the site and the north of the river including the City Centre. A detailed submission to confirm the £1.5m of funding for the Scarborough Bridge Scheme has been submitted with an expectation that a decision will be taken at the YNYER Infrastructure Committee on 4 October.
- 32. It is proposed to make use of £464k of currently unallocated 2018/19 Local Transport Plan funds to cover the risk element of the project. Alternative transport schemes will be brought forward for delivery

depending upon the actual expenditure against the Scarborough Bridge scheme in 2018/19.

#### **Human Resources**

33. There are no HR implications

### **One Planet Council / Equalities**

34. The new bridge and access ramps will be designed with equalities in mind. The main purpose of the project is to improve access for all users and promoting sustainable transport.

### Legal

35. The Council has powers under various legislation which allow for the construction of a bridge. It is noted that the main purpose of the project is to improve access for all users. Members are well aware of their duties under the Equality Act and, in particular, the duty to promote equality of opportunity. It will be particularly important to ensure that the design of the new bridge reflects this duty.

#### **Crime and Disorder**

36. There are no Crime and Disorder implications.

### **Information Technology**

37. There are no Information Technology implications.

# **Property**

38. is proposed that the new bridge and associated structures (i.e. ramps and steps) will in the future be owned and maintained by City of York Council. However the land they would be constructed upon would remain Network Rail freehold.

#### Other

39. Disruption during construction – Constructing a scheme of this size and complexity inevitably means a level of disruption to users of the existing footbridge. Access to and use of the existing footbridge will be maintained for as long as possible, but the river crossing will unavoidably be out of action for the period of construction requiring a temporary suspension of the public right of way which runs across it. Works will be scheduled and planned to minimise disruption where practicable and sufficient information and notice will be given to affected parties.

## **Risk Management**

- 40. A full risk register has been prepared for the project identifying the main risks affecting the delivery of the scheme. The risk register will be monitored regularly and mitigation measures put in place as necessary.
- 41. One of the principal risks is the availability of funding owing to the need to obtain confirmation from the other contributors before progressing the delivery contract. Several break-points have been built into the programme with Network Rail to mitigate the impact of this risk. Other risks relate to planning consent, railway interface etc.
- 42. Generally project risks are recorded within the Project Risk Register and managed by the Project Team and monitored by the Transport Board.

#### **Contact Details**

Author:

Richard Holland
Transport Project Manager
Tel No. 01904 551401

Tony Clarke
Head of Transport
Tel No. 01904 551641

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

James Gilchrist
Assistant Director – Transport, Highways
& Environment

Report
Approved

Date 17/08/2017
Approved

# **Specialist Implications Officer(s):**

Financial
Debbie Mitchell
Corporate Finance Manager

#### Wards Affected:

Clifton, Guildhall, Holgate, Micklegate

For further information please contact the report author

#### Annexes:

Annex A – Plan demonstrating the connectivity of Scarborough Bridge

Annex B – Plan of proposed Scarborough Bridge upgrade

Annex C – Results of public consultation held during July 2017